

## COMMITTEE REPORT

**Committee:** West and City Centre      **Ward:** Guildhall  
**Date:** 21 September 2006      **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel

**Reference:** 06/00725/LBC  
**Application at:** The Judges Lodging 9 Lendal York YO1 8AQ  
**For:** Alterations and refurbishment of existing hotel, restaurant and bar and canopies to rear terrace area  
**By:** Judges Lodgings Ltd  
**Application Type:** Listed Building Consent  
**Target Date:** 29 May 2006

### 1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 This is a companion application for Listed Building consent for the preceding item. It is not intended to reproduce the report in full as the issue of the impact on the Listed Building is also covered in the report for planning permission. This report will cover any significant alterations to the fabric of the Listed Building that have not been considered in the planning application.

1.2 If Members are minded to approve this application for Listed Building consent, the application will require to be notified to the Secretary of State who may call- in the application for his determination.

1.3 This application has been referred to the West and Centre Sub-Committee at the request of Councillor Brian Watson because of the degree of alteration to the Listed Building.

### 2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area Central Historic Core 0038

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings Multiple (Spatial)

2.2 Policies:

CYHE4  
Listed Buildings

CYGP1  
Design

### 3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL

## URBAN DESIGN AND CONSERVATION- Design

The proposals in general work with the listed building, would increase access for people with physical disabilities, and would re-vitalise the inside and outside of this landmark building in Lendal. Conditions required.

### 3.2 EXTERNAL

#### ENGLISH HERITAGE

Comments of 21.4.2006- Do not object to the proposed alterations to the lower ground floor bar areas, the installation of the platform lift and the spiral escape stair. Do not object in principle to the canopies, but further details are required to clarify their impact. More information is required about the impact that building, environmental health and fire regulations would have on the Listed Building.

Comments of 6.7.2006- Do not wish to comment further on the additional details, and the application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance, and in the basis of specialist conservation advice.

#### GUILDHALL PLANNING PANEL

Comments of 24.4.2006- The Panel support the proposed adaptations in principle but are concerned that greater attention is given to the detailed design and proposed accretions before approval is given.

GUILDHALL PLANNING PANEL( Response to additional information, received 27.6.2006 )- No objections to ramp, but express concern about the proposed awnings to the rear terrace

Press Advert Expiry Date- 10.5.2006

Site Notice Expiry Date- 3.5.2006

Consultation Expiry Date- 12.7.2006 (following an additional consultation with further details)

No other representations have been received as a result of the consultations detailed above.

## 4.0 APPRAISAL

### 4.1 ADDITIONAL PLANNING POLICY

Policy E4, North Yorkshire County Structure Plan- Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas

Policy E5, North Yorkshire County Structure Plan- Archaeology

PPS 1 " Delivering Sustainable Development "

PPG15 " Planning and the Historic Environment "

### 4.2 KEY ISSUE

- Impact on the historic character and visual amenity of the listed building

4.3 The issue of the visual impact of the canopies on the rear elevation of this Grade I Listed building and the proposed ramp are considered in the previous report. Many of the internal works are required under the Disability Discrimination Act to improve accessibility to all buildings and it is acknowledged that the varied internal floor levels within the Judges

Lodgings makes this difficult. The intention is to raise the existing floor level of Seating area 1 which would then allow access to all bar areas within the lower ground floor. This would require the lifting of the arched opening between Seating areas 1 and 2 by 200mm. This opening was formed during refurbishment in 1979/80 and it should be noted that the basement area has been much modernised. With the removal of the existing plant room and boiler room ( 1979/80 ) and the 1995 stairs to the first floor, a new ramp would be formed to give access from the front seating areas to the new bar area and toilet facilities. As the route would use an existing blocked-up opening ( 1979/80 ) there would be minimal impact on the original fabric of the Listed Building. A new lift would be provided in the two storey extension ( completed 1979- 1980 ) with toilets at ground and first floor levels. The Conservation Officer has expressed concern about the amount of cobbled surface that would be lost to the ramped entrance area to the self contained ground floor flat that is situated to the right hand side of the building. Whilst it is appreciated that a cobbled surface is not suitable for a person with an ambulant disability, it is considered that the area of cobbles to be removed could be reduced without compromising manoeuvrability. Subject to appropriate conditions it is considered that the works would improve wheelchair/ ambulant access in the internal and external public areas of the lower and upper floor levels with minimal impact on the original fabric of the building.

4.4 The proposed works would increase the bar sales area. The works involve the opening of an original opening between seating areas; the building of a new bar store and plant room at the rear of the building, with the stairs repositioned to suit; refurbishment and formation of new steps to differing floor levels; removal of the existing bar to increase seating; the creation of a new bar, seating area and toilet facilities in the rear 1995/6 extension; the existing external stairs to the terrace to be removed and set aside for later re-use. It is intended that all new brick work would be in second hand clamp bricks to match the existing brickwork; with re-used stone steps, metal balustrades and railings, and new stone copings to match. It is also intended to relocate the kitchen back into the main building as it was prior to the extension being built. The agent has indicated that the present position of the kitchen to the rear of the property presents operational difficulties due to its distance from the breakfast room and restaurant. This relocation would result in a number of alterations that include the removal of modern female toilets ( 1988 ) and an en-suite bedroom; two new openings between existing modern partitions; the re-opening of an original window between a bedroom and a service corridor, and the installation of a ramp to cater for differing floor levels. The provision of a new dumb waiter would entail the formation of two new steps, and it is intended that the existing steps would be retained and boarded over. The existing resident's bar structure would be resited to allow for better staff access and to enable the re-instatement of the original route between the resident's lounge and the bar and to the serviced apartments. The removal of an existing modern stair ( 1995 ) and a new floor would allow direct access to the existing terrace, and new doors would reflect the design of the existing double front entrance doors. The existing fire escape route to the second floor in this area would be altered with the provision of a spiral staircase in an existing store ( circ 1936 ) and an externally opening escape rooflight.

4.5 The internal works that are required to provide serviced apartments on the ground floor and upper and first floor of the service wing involve the removal of a rear wall of the Dealtry suite to enlarge the suite, the existing double door opening to the service corridor to be infilled with clamp bricks, and the provision of a new timber sash window. The existing staffroom, laundry and store area would be altered to suite new accommodation requirements and new staff facilities would be installed with a changing room. A modern garage door would be infilled to match the existing external finish. The addition/ removal and alterations to partitioning would allow bathrooms/ kitchens to be provided and to meet fire and building regulations. The agent has indicated that the two first and second floor doorways within the main building would require to be blocked up for fire safety, with the existing doors, frames and linings retained. All new bathrooms and kitchens would use

existing drainage, and the agent has provided the details of the alterations that would be necessary. This information has raised no concerns from English Heritage and the Council's Conservation Officer.

4.6 Clearly the combined works would have a significant impact on this Grade I Listed Building. In the cases where the alterations would affect the more historic parts of the building, it is considered that the works have been justified and the degree of intervention and alteration to the fabric of the Listed Building has been minimised. Areas of greatest change would take place in the more modern areas and these have been sensitive to the overall character of the building. The proposals would allow this building to be adapted for 21st century use and would bring about a number of benefits, especially the increased access for people with physical disabilities. This is a complex building and the agents have met the challenge of proposing changes that would work with the listed building in a sensitive manner in most cases. The installation of a kitchen in one of the principal rooms of the main building ( currently the Jean Jacques suite ) would be the most contrived change and it would detract from the high quality of this ante-room; however it is central to creating a high quality flat unit which in turn benefits the building's viability. Similarly the conversion of the ' Michael Angelo ' suite on the lower ground floor to the main kitchen would result in the loss of an attractive if simple living room. Again there are wider benefits resulting in a more efficient use of space. The canopies have been discussed in the previous application.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 It is therefore concluded that the proposals, subject to conditions, would comply with Policy HE4 of the Local Plan, Policy E4 of the Structure Plan, and national guidance in Planning Policy Guidance Note No. 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment, " where the aim is to protect the historic character and visual amenity of Listed Buildings from inappropriate and harmful alterations and development.

## COMMITTEE TO VISIT

**6.0 RECOMMENDATION:** Approve after referral to Sec. of State

1 TIMEL2

2

The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans and other submitted details:-

Drawing Nos.	3679 (60) 01
	3679 ((90) 02
	3679 (00) 07 A
	3679 (00) 08 A
	3679 (00) 09
	3679 (00) 10
	3680 (00) 03

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority as an amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

- 3 Notwithstanding any proposed materials specified on the approved drawings or in the application form submitted with the application, the following samples of shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

- a) Samples of the aggregate and brick to be used for the ramped entrance and surfacing
- b) Samples of the cloth and colour of the canopy
- c) Samples of the material and finish of the framework for the awning

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity

- 4 Large scale details of the items listed below shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development and the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

- a) Large scale details of the ramp to the self-contained ground floor flat

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details.

- 5 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, a methodology statement for the renovation and refurbishment work, with particular reference to the service runs, upgrading of doors, windows, creation of partitions shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority and thereafter implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the works respect the special historic interest of the Listed Building

- 6 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the following details as listed below shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority, and thereafter implemented in accordance with the approved details-

- a) Jean Jacques Room- To scale drawings of the kitchen units in relation to the existing doorway and wall detailing.

- b) Lower Ground Floor-

Bar area- details of finish to raised archways

Seating area 1- Details of floor level to existing fireplace

Seating area 3- Existing external door to be retained. Details of upgrading to meet building regulations required

Kitchen- Details of fitting out, in particular the relationship of the food preparation areas to windows

- c) New Staff Accommodation- To-scale details of new windows

- 7 The material to be used for the canopy and awnings shall not be replaced without the prior consent of the Local Planning Authority for a non-approved fabric.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity.

## **7.0 INFORMATIVES:**

### **Notes to Applicant**

#### **1. REASON FOR APPROVAL**

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference the visual amenity and character of the listed building. As such, the proposal complies with Policy E4 of the North Yorkshire County Structure Plan; Policies HE4 and GP1 of the City of York Draft Local Plan- Incorporating the Proposed 4th Set of Changes Deposit Draft; and national planning guidance contained in Planning Policy Statement 1 " Delivering Sustainable Development " and Planning Policy Guidance Note No. 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment. "

#### **Contact details:**

**Author:** Fiona Mackay Development Control Officer (Tues - Fri)  
**Tel No:** 01904 552407